

Binucleate *Rhizoctonia repens* Bernard as a Biocontrol Agent against Damping-off Disease of Cucumber Plants

Ismail Erper^{1*} • Gürsel Hatat Karaca² • Ibrahim Ozkoc³ • Muharrem Turkkan⁴

¹ Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Ondokuz Mayıs University, Samsun, Turkey

² Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Suleyman Demirel University, Isparta, Turkey

³ Department of Biology Sciences, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, Ondokuz Mayıs University, Samsun, Turkey

⁴ Department of Plant Protection, Faculty of Agriculture, Ordu University, Ordu, Turkey

Corresponding author: * ismailer@omu.edu.tr

ABSTRACT

Efficiency of *Rhizoctonia repens* Bernard, previously isolated from *Spiranthes sinensis* (Pers.) Ames, for biological control of 3 virulent fungal isolates belonging to *Fusarium oxysporum*, *Pythium ultimum* and *Rhizoctonia solani* AG-4 was investigated under *in vivo* conditions. The study, including eight treatments; *R. repens*, *F. oxysporum*, *R. repens+F. oxysporum*, *P. ultimum*, *R. repens+P. ultimum*, *R. solani* AG 4, *R. repens+R. solani* AG 4 and control, was performed in 5 replicates. *R. solani* AG 4 was the most virulent pathogen as compared to the other pathogens. *R. repens* didn't cause any symptoms on cucumber plants in the experiments, and reduced the severity of root rot disease caused by *R. solani*, *P. ultimum* and *F. oxysporum*. There were significant differences between the root length and fresh weight of the plants in pots inoculated with the pathogens alone and that of the plants in pots inoculated with the pathogens plus *R. repens* (P < 0.05).

Keywords: Cucumis sativus L., biocontrol, binucleate Rhizoctonia, soil-borne pathogens

INTRODUCTION

Vegetables are cultivated well in tropical and subtropical regions and also grown in greenhouses or under plastic structure in cooler areas. Different vegetable species were commonly produced in Samsun province, located in the Black Sea Region, with a total greenhouse area of 26.253 decare and production of 144.794 tons/year. Cucumber (*Cucumis sativus* L.), is one of the most important vegateble species produced in the greenhouses in Samsun (Anonymous 2012).

Like other agricultural crops, significant yield losses are caused by soil-borne fungi on cucumbers growing in greenhouses every year (Villajuan-Abgona *et al.* 1996). Root rot and damping-off diseases caused by *Rhizoctonia solani* Kuhn, *Fusarium oxysporum* Schlecht. emend. Snyd. Hans., and *Pythium ultimum* Trow are the most important and common diseases of young cucumber plants (Mitidieri and De Mitidieri 1994; Erper and Karaca 1998).

Control of these pathogens is rather difficult due to their ecological behavior, extremely broad host range and high survival rate of resistant forms such as sclerotia and chlamydospores under different environmental conditions (Yangui et al. 2008). Although the use of wide spectrum chemicals is the most efficient and economical control method in small areas like greenhouses, these chemicals effect beneficial microorganisms as well and destroy biological balance in soil (Lifshitz et al. 1985). Therefore, studies on biological control, which only decrease populations of pathogens and keep biological balance, gained importance in recent years. For this purpose, many soil microorganisms were investigated and some of them were prepared for practical use (Koch 1999). Many researchers evaluated the potential use of Rhizoctonia group fungi against soil borne pathogens as biological control agents. Some multinucleate (MN) R. solani and binucleate (BN) Rhizoctonia isolates were found to be non-pathogenic and used against pathogenic Rhizoctonia spp. (IchielevichAuster *et al.* 1985). Additionally, it was also reported that BN *Rhizoctonia* effectively controlled damping off diseases caused by *R. solani*, *Pythium* spp., *Phytophthora* spp., and *Fusarium* spp. in multiple host plants (Cardoso and Echandi 1987; Harris *et al.* 1993; Sumner and Bell 1994; Villajuan-Abgona *et al.* 1996; Cassiolato *et al.* 1997; Burns and Benson 1998; Cartwright and Spurr 1998; Poromarto *et al.* 1998; Xue *et al.* 1998; Muslim *et al.* 2003). BN *Rhizoctonia* were known to have different modes of action in the protection of plants against pathogens. They can form dense mycelial mats on underground plant parts and may compete for nutrients by occupying infection sites (Sneh *et al.* 1989). There is also evidence that they can induce resistance mechanisms of plants (Sneh and Ichielevich-Auster 1995; Xue *et al.* 1998; Hwang and Benson 2003).

Strains of Ceratobasidium spp. commonly exist in mycorrhizal associations with orchids (Sneh 1996). These orchid associated Rhizoctonia strains are reported to form typical morphological structures in host tissues that were mentioned as monilioid cells (Zelmer et al. 1996; Sharma et al. 2003). Some BN Rhizoctonia species are known to have mycorrhizal associations with orchids and non-pathogenic on other plants. Rhizoctonia repens Bernard is one of the first three species reported as orchid endophytes. It was also reported that R. repens protected orchid bulbs against pathogens by inducing inhibitory chemicals (Stoessl 1983). Virulence of R. repens isolates were investigated on different plants and it was found that the fungus was non-pathogenic on most of the plants and also increased the root lengths of some of them (Ozkoc et al. 2002). Similarly, Villajuan-Abgona et al. (1996) determined the positive effect of BN Rhizoctonia strain W7 on plant growth, as a significant increase in plant fresh weight and height.

Different researchers suggested the timing of the biocontrol inoculation as an important parameter. In a previous study, biocontrol effect of BN *Rhizoctonia* againts fungal pathogens was investigated by inoculating the fungus before or at the same time with the pathogens. Protective effects of BN *Rhizoctonia* against *R. solani* were obtained following its pre-inoculation either before short periods like 24 h (Poromarto *et al.* 1998), 48 h (Xue *et al.* 1998) or 7 or more days (Hwang and Benson 2003) before *R. solani* attack.

The objectives of this study were to evaluate the possible use of BN *R. repens* 624 isolate in the biological control of *F. oxysporum*, *P. ultimum* and *R. solani* AG 4 which cause root rot and damping off diseases on cucumber plants, *in vivo*.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Source of isolates

Three virulent isolates of *Fusarium oxysporum* (isolate 55-05), *Pythium ultimum* (isolate 55-22) and *Rhizoctonia solani* AG-4 (isolate 55-78) were obtained from the cucumber (*Cucumis sativus* L.) plants showing root rot symptoms grown in the greenhouses in Samsun province and that were determined to be virulent on cucumber plants *in vivo*. BN *Rhizoctonia repens* Bernard isolate 624 was obtained from *Spiranthes sinensis* (Pers.) Ames and known to be avirulent on cucumber plants (Ozkoc *et al.* 2002). The cultures of the fungi were maintained on 3.9% potato dextrose agar (PDA, Oxoid Ltd., Basingstoke, Hampshire, England). PDA slants were stored at +4°C and served as stock cultures for further use.

In vivo treatments

The effect of BN R. repens isolate on F. oxysporum, P. ultimum and R. solani AG-4 were investigated by in vivo experiments. Seeds of MAY Beith Alpha F1 cucumber cultivar were used in the experiment. Cucumber seeds were first surface-disinfected in 70% ethyl alcohol, and then in 1% NaOCl for 5 min. (Ichielevich-Auster et al. 1985). After rinsing three times with sterile distilled water, they were blotted dry between sterile paper towels. Five seeds each were planted in plastic pots (1 kg) containing potting mix (field soil, composted manure, sand at 1:1:1, v/v) which was autoclaved for 1 h at 121°C, on 2 successive days. R. repens 624 was incubated on PDA at $26 \pm 2^{\circ}$ C in the dark. In the experiment with R. repens, intact agar blocks with R. repens grown on PDA (20 ml/plate) were placed into a depth of 1.5-2 cm in a pot, the seeds were sown on the agar blocks and covered with the potting mix. The pots were watered with sterile distilled water and kept in greenhouse conditions with temperatures at 23-30°C. After ten days, 5 agar discs of 5 mm diameter from the growing edges of the cultures of F. oxysporum, P. ultimum and R. solani AG 4 isolates were placed nearby (about 0.5-1 cm) the roots of the plants in the pots. Agar discs without any organism were used as controls. After incubation in the greenhouse for 4 weeks, plants were uprooted and washed. Disease severity was rated by using 1-5 scale modified after Muyolo *et al.* (1993), where 1 = healthy seedling, 2 =very little superficial lesions on roots and hypocothyls, 3 = deepand large lesions on the roots or on the hypocotyls, 4 = severe root rot, lesions surrounding hypocotyl, partially restricted root length, and 5 = complete root-rot. In addition, root lengths and fresh weights of the plants were measured (Ozkoc et al. 2002). In the experiment, eight different treatments (R. repens, F. oxysporum, R. repens+F. oxysporum, P. ultimum, R. repens+P. ultimum, R. solani AG 4, R. repens+R. solani AG 4 and control) and five replicates were used.

Statistical analysis

All experiments were conducted using completely randomized block design. The fresh weight, root length and disease severity scores were recorded for each plant. The average of the scores of the five plants in each pot represented one experimental unit. The data obtained from the study were subjected to analysis of variance (One Way ANOVA) using the IBM SPSS Statistics Program (version 19, Property of SPSS, Inc., IBM Company, USA), and significant differences between means were determined using Duncan's Multiple Range Test.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Cucumber cultivation in the greenhouses is gradually growing in Samsun province, Turkey. In connection with the cultivation, root-rot diseases have also been increasing every year in the greenhouses. However, there is not enough effort on the development of effective and safe control strategies especially against diseases caused by R. solani, P. ultimum and F. oxysporum. Chemical control is not satisfactory, and biological control has shown potential as an alternative disease management strategy (Lemanceau and Alabouvette 1993; Larkin and Fravel 1998). Non-pathogenic BN Rhizoctonia were found to be an effective biological control agent against such diseases (Burns and Benson 1998; Harris et al. 1993; Sumner and Bell 1994; Villajuan-Abgona et al. 1996; Cassiolato et al. 1997; Cartwright and Spurr 1998; Poromarto et al. 1998; Xue et al. 1998; Muslim et al. 2003). Researchers determined that BN Rhizoctonia had several mode of actions that support biological control against plant diseases. These include: (i) forming dense mycelial mats on plant roots, (ii) competing for nutrients by occupying infection sites, (iii) enhancing the resistance mechanisms in BN Rhizoctonia-preinoculated plants against pathogens (Sneh et al. 1989; Sneh and Ichielevich-Auster 1995; Xue et al. 1998; Hwang and Benson 2003).

There is little knowledge about the pathogenicity of BN R. repens, known to be mycorrhizal with orchids, on different plants. The results of the present study showed that BN R. repens did not cause any symptoms on the cucumber plants. In the statistical analysis, there was also not a significant difference between the growth of cucumber plants in the pots treated only with BN R. repens and in the nontreated control pots ($\dot{P} < 0.05$) (Table 1). In the study, R. solani was the most virulent pathogen on cucumber plants, followed by P. ultimum and F. oxysporum, respectively. BN R. repens somewhat reduced the severity of root rot disease caused by the pathogens. The antagonistic effect of BN R. repens against the pathogens was clear and cucumber plants in pots inoculated with the pathogen plus BN R. repens had lower severity than that of the pathogen alone. Our findings were supported by the previous studies having similar results on the use of BN *Rhizoctonia* in the control of diseases caused by R. solani, Pythium spp., Phytophthora spp. and Fusarium spp. (Cardoso and Echandi 1987; Cubeta and Echandi 1991; Cartwright and Spurr 1998; Poromarto et al. 1998; Xue et al. 1998; Burns and Benson 1998; Ozkoc et al. 2002).

In this study, fresh weights of the plants in pots inoculated only with BN R. repens were higher than that of all the plants in other treatments, but this difference was not statistically significant (Table 1). Similarly, the root lengths of the plants inoculated only with R. repens was higher than that of control plants, but this difference was not statistically significant. The root lengths of the plants inoculated only with the pathogens were lower than those inoculated with the pathogens plus R. repens, except P. ultimum. Previous studies reported that BN Rhizoctonia promoted plant growth and controlled damping-off disease (Harris et al. 1994; Villajuan-Abgona et al. 1996; Harris 1999; Ozkoc et al. 2002; Chang and Chou 2007). Villajuan-Abgona et al. (1996) reported that BN Rhizoctonia strain W7 increased plant height and fresh weight. Similarly, Harris (1999) presented results where BN Rhizoctonia isolates increased Capsicum shoot and root dry weights. Chang and Chou (2007) showed that both orchid mycorrhizal fungi, BN Rhizoctonia and Rhizoctonia solani AG-6, stimulated the growth of orchid Anoectochilus formosanus as compared to non-mycorrhizal plants. It was determined that root length, fresh weight, plant height and number of leaves were enhanced by both fungi.

In many studies, the timing of the biocontrol inoculation was mentioned as an important parameter. Effect of BN *Rhizoctonia* on the biocontrol of fungal pathogens was investigated by inoculating the fungus before or at the same time with pathogens. It was determined that protective

Table 1 Effects of Rhizoctonia repens on the disease severity caused by Fusarium oxysporum. Pythium ultimum and Rhizoctonia solani AG 4 and on the root length and fresh weights of cucumber seedlings.

Treatments	Disease severity	Root length (cm)	Fresh weight (g)
R. repens	$1.00^* \pm 0.00 \text{ g}^{**}$	11.52 ± 2.97 a	3.66 ± 0.54 a
F. oxysporum	$2.04 \pm 0.61 \text{ e}$	$7.28\pm0.96~\mathrm{c}$	$2.60 \pm 0.38 \text{ bc}$
R. repens+ F. oxysporum	$1.84 \pm 0.55 \ f$	$9.64\pm0.97~b$	2.85 ± 0.36 abc
P. ultimum	$3.36 \pm 0.91 \text{ c}$	$7.34 \pm 1.03 \text{ c}$	$2.04 \pm 0.67 \ cd$
R. repens+ P. ultimum	$2.80 \pm 0.58 \text{ d}$	$8.12 \pm 0.90 \ c$	$2.60 \pm 0.45 \text{ bc}$
R. solani AG-4	4.84 ± 0.37 a	$0.80 \pm 1.64 \text{ e}$	0.37 ± 0.42 e
R. repens+ R. solani AG-4	$4.00\pm0.65~b$	$4.78 \pm 1.15 \text{ d}$	$1.54 \pm 0.53 \text{ d}$
Control	1.04 ± 0.20 g	11.40 ± 1.60 a	3.43 ± 0.39 ab

Disease severity were evaluated by using 1-5 scale: 1= healthy seedling, 2= very little superficial lesions on roots and hypocotyls, 3= deep and large lesions on the roots or

on the hypocotyls, 4= severe root rot, lesions surrounding hypocotyls, partially restricted root length, and 5= complete root-rot. *** Means in a column followed by the same letter are not significantly different from each other according to Duncan's multiple range test (P < 0.05).

effect of BN Rhizoctonia against R. solani were obtained following its pre-inoculation, either short periods like 24 h (Poromarto et al. 1998) and 48 h (Xue et al. 1998) or 7 or more days before R. solani attack (Hwang and Benson 2003). Villajuan-Abgona et al. (1996) used three BN Rhizoctonia isolates against R. solani AG-2-2 and AG-4 causing disease on cucumber plants. They inoculated pathogen isolates 0, 1, 2, 4 and 7 days after BN Rhizoctonia inoculation and determined that the protective effect of BN Rhi*zoctonia* increased with the increase of interaction periods. Dolan et al. (1986) inoculated a BN Rhizoctonia isolate 48 hours before Phytophthora cinnamomi and P. citricola inoculations causing the stem lesions on Persea spp., and found that BN Rhizoctonia decreased the lesion width. Sneh (1996) reported that BN Rhizoctonia were not effective when applied at the same time with the pathogen and mentioned that this was due to the slow growing of BN Rhizoctonia. In contrast, there are some reports indicating that BN Rhizoctonia were effective on pathogens even if they were inoculated at the same time. Cardoso and Echandi (1987) tested a BN Rhizoctonia isolate against MN Rhizoctonia causing root rot on bean by inoculating the pathogen and BN Rhizoctonia at the same time and determined that the application had protective effect against the pathogen. Similar findings were obtained by Harris et al. (1994) as well. In the present study, BN R. repens was applied adjacent to the roots of the plants 10 days before the inoculation of the fungal pathogens to the same roots, in order to give BN R. repens chance to colonize on plant roots before the pathogen. As a result, BN R. repens enhanced plant growth and reduced root rot disease severity caused by the pathogens.

CONCLUSIONS

The results of this study showed that BN R. repens increased fresh weight and root lenght of the cucumber plants and reduced the severity of root rot disease caused by R. solani, P. ultimum and F. oxysporum (P < 0.05). Since there is not enough knowledge about the pathogenicity of BN R. repens on different plants, detailed research is needed to determine its effects on pathogens causing diseases on different plants. Other BN Rhizoctonia isolates should also be evaluted for their possible use against plant pathogens.

REFERENCES

Anonymous (2009) Tarımsal Yapı (Uretim Fiyat, Deger). TC Basbakanlık Devlet Istatistik Enstitusu

- Burns JR, Benson DM (1998) Biological control of Pythium damping-off of vinca with binucleate Rhizoctonia spp. Phytopathology 88, 124
- Cardoso JE, Echandi E (1987) Nature of protection of bean seedlings from Rhizoctonia root rot by a binucleate Rhizoctonia-like fungus. Phytopathology 77.1548-1551
- Cartwright DK, Spurr HW Jr. (1988) Biological control of Phytophthora parasitica var. nicotianae on tobacco seedlings with non-pathogenic binucleate Rhizoctonia fungi. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 30 (14), 1879-1884
- Cassiolato AMR, Ceresini PC, Souza NL (1997) Potential of Rhizoctonia spp. binucleate and R. solani hypovirulent as biocontrol agent against R. solani Kuhn. Phytopathology 87, 15

Chang DC-N, Chou L-C (2007) Growth responses, enzyme activities, and

component changes as influenced by Rhizoctonia orchid mycorrhiza on Anoectochilus formosanus Hayata. Botanical Studies 48, 445-451

- Cubeta MA, Echandi E (1991) Biological control of Rhizoctonia and Pythium damping-off of cucumber: An integrated approach. Biological Control 1, 227-236
- Dolan TE, Cohen Y, Coffey MD (1986) Protection of Persea species against Phytophthora cinnamomi and P. citricola by prior inoculation with a citrus isolate of P. parasitica. Phytopathology 76, 194-198
- Erper I, Hatat G (1998) Samsun ili sebze seralarında solgunluk hastalığının yayılışının, yoğunluğunun ve hastalığa neden olan etmenlerin belirlenmesi. Türkiye VIII. Fitopatoloji Kongresi Bildirileri, 21-25 Eylül 1998, Ankara, pp 283-287
- Harris AR, Schisler DA, Ryder MH (1993) Binucleate Rhizoctonia isolates control damping-off caused by Pythium ultimum var. sporangiiferum, and promote growth in Capsicum and Celosia seedlings in pasteurized potting medium. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 25 (7), 909-914
- Harris AR, Schisler DA, Neate SM, Ryder MH (1994) Suppression of damping-off caused by Rhizoctonia solani and growth promotion in the bedding plants by binucleate Rhizoctonia spp. Soil Biology and Biochemistry 26 (2), 263-268
- Harris AR (1999) Plant growth promotion by binucleate Rhizoctonia and bacterial isolates in monoxenic cultures. Microbiological Research 154, 71-74
- Hwang J, Benson DM (2003) Expression of induced systemic resistance in poinsettia cuttings against Rhizoctonia stem rot by treatment of stock plants with binucleate Rhizoctonia. Biological Control 27, 73-80
- Ichielevich-Auster M, Sneh B, Koltin Y, Barash I (1985) Suppression of damping-off caused by Rhizoctonia species by a nonpathogenic isolate of R. solani. Phytopathology 75, 1080-1084
- Koch E (1999) Evaluation of commercial products for microbial control of soilborne plant diseases. Crop Protection 18 (2), 119-125
- Larkin RP, Fravel DR (1998) Efficacy of various fungal and bacterial biocontrol organisms for control of Fusarium wilt of tomato. Plant Disease 82, 1022-1028
- Lemanceau P, Alabouvette C (1993) Suppression of Fusarium wilts by fluorescent pseudomonads: mechanisms and applications. Biocontrol Science and Technology 3, 297-304
- Lifshitz R, Lifshitz S, Baker R (1985) Decrease in incidence of Rhizoctonia pre-emergence damping-off by use of integrated chemical and biological controls. Plant Disease 69, 431-434
- Mitidieri IM, De-Mitidieri IM (1994) The main diseases which affect horticultural crops grown under cover in Northern Buenos Aires, Argentina. Acta Horticulturae 357, 143-152
- Muyolo NG, Lipps PE, Schmitthenner AF (1993) Anastomosis grouping and variation in virulence among isolates of Rhizoctonia solani associated with dry bean and soybean in Ohio and Zaire. Phytopathology 83, 438-444
- Muslim A, Horinouchi H, and Hyakumachi M (2003) Biological control of Fusarium wilt of tomato with hypovirulent binucleate Rhizoctonia in greenhouse conditions. Mycoscience 44 (2), 77-84
- Ozkoc I, Karaca G, Erper I (2002) Pathogenicity of Rhizoctonia repens Bernard on different plants and its effect on the suppression of root-rot on cucumber plants. Acta Horticulturae 579, 463-467
- Poromarto SH, Nelson BD, Freeman TP (1998) Association of binucleate Rhizoctonia with soybean and mechanism of biocontrol of Rhizoctonia solani. Phytopathology 88, 1056-1067
- Sharma J, Zettler LW, Van-Sambeek JW (2003) A survey of mycobionts of federally threatened Planthera praeclare (Orchidaceae). Symbiosis 34, 145-155
- Sneh B, Ichielevich-Auster M, Plaut Z (1989) Mechanism of seedling protection induced by a hypovirulent isolate of Rhizoctonia solani. Canadian Journal of Botany 67, 2135-2141
- Sneh B, Ichielevich-Auster M (1995) Induced resistance of cucumber seedlings caused by non pathogenic Rhizoctonia (np-R) isolates. In: International Symposium on Rhizoctonia, Facts and Challenges in Pathology, Taxonomy, Ecology and Disease Control, June 27-30, Noordwijkerhout, The Netherlands, Abstract No. pp 8-3

- Sneh B (1996) Non pathogenic isolates of *Rhizoctonia* spp. (np-R) and their role in biological control. In: Sneh B, Jabaji-Hare S, Neate S, Dijst G (Eds) *Rhizoctonia Species: Taxonomy, Molecular Biology, Ecology, Pathology and Disease Control*, Kluwer Academic Publishers, Dordrecht, the Netherlands, pp 473-483
- Stoessl A (1983) Secondary plant metabolites in preinfectional and postinfectional resistance. In: Bailey JA, Deverall BJ (Eds) *The Dynamics of Host Defence*, Academic Press, London, pp 71-122
- Sumner DR, Bell DK (1994) Survival of *Rhizoctonia* spp. and root diseases in a rotation of corn, snap bean, and peanut in microplots. *Phytopathology* 84 (2), 113-118
- Villajuan-Abgona R, Kageyama K, Hyakumachi M (1996) Biological of

Rhizoctonia damping-off of cucumber by non-pathogenic binucleate *Rhizoctonia*. *European Journal of Plant Pathology* **102**, 227-235

- Xue L, Charest PM, Jabaji-Hare SH (1998) Systemic induction of peroxidases, 1,3-β-Glucanases, chitinases, and resistance in bean plants by binucleate *Rhizoctonia* species. *Phytopathology* **88**, 359-365
- Yangui T, Rhouma A, Triki MA, Gargouri K, Bouzid J (2008) Control of damping-off caused by *Rhizoctonia solani* and *Fusarium solani* using olive mill waste water and some of its indigenous bacterial strains. *Crop Protection*, 27 (2), 89-197
- Zemler CD, Cuthbertson L, Currah RS (1996) Fungi associated with terrestrial orchid mycorrhizas, seeds and protocorms. *Mycoscience* 37, 439-448